Appendix B



Internal Audit Final Report

Maesteg Swimming Pool

Directorate: Wellbeing Date: 23rd April 2008. Contents

- 1. Introduction
- 2. Objectives of the Audit
- 3. Audit Opinion
- 4. Findings and Recommendations
 - 4.1. Budgetary Control & Management Information Systems
 - 4.2. Cash Control
 - 4.3. Income
 - 4.4. Ordering, receipt and payment of goods and services
 - 4.5. Payroll and Staffing
 - 4.6. Procedures
 - 4.7. Statutory
 - 4.8. Stock Control
 - 4.9. Security
 - 4.10. Follow Up
- 5. Management Action Plan

Auditor: Jane Evans & Melanie Perfect

1. Introduction

- 1.1. An audit at the Maesteg Swimming Pool was carried out in July 2007 as part of the internal audit plan for 2006/07. The previous audit was in 2004/05 when the overall audit opinion was that inadequate controls were in operation to minimise potential risks to the authority.
- 1.2. The 2004/05 audit was also subject to a follow up review in 2005/06. The original 9 significant recommendations made in the 2005 report were reviewed to assess the progress of implementation. At the time of the follow up just 1 recommendation was found to have been implemented with a further 5 being categorised as in the process of being implemented. These recommendations were revisited during the course of this audit and are included in the main body of the report.
- 1.3. The Pool has suffered with staffing difficulties for approximately two years, with the long term absence of the Pool Manager, this has been seen to impact on the paperwork completion and compliance with expected controls.
- 1.4. Maesteg Swimming Pool has a Management team consisting of a Pool Manager and two Head Attendants. Temporary changes to the management team to cover long term absence have led to inconsistent management and leadership of the Pool.
- 1.5. Business Plan for the Pool for 2006/07 was not available during our review.

Income	2006/07	2005/06
Fees & Charges	£87,552	£91,399
Bridge Card Sales	£116,399	£116,920
Vending	£11,575	£13,768
Total Income	£215,526	£222,087
Expenditure	2006/07	2005/06
General expenditure	£411,407	£380,784
Repairs	£34,117	£24,041
Total Expenditure	£445,524	£404,825

Net deficit /Subsidy

1.6. Levels of income and expenditure for 2005/06 to 2006/07 are summarised below:

1.7 The Authority has therefore subsidised the operations of the pool by £229,998 in 2006/07 which is an increase in the deficit of £47,260 from 2005/06. Much of this is due to an increase in staffing and utility costs together with a fall in income.

£182,738

£229.998

- 1.8 The functions of the section were documented, key controls were identified and testing undertaken. The audit findings are based on discussions with staff, observations, and the results of sample testing. Visits to the Pool involved the review of key areas which include:
 - Policy & Procedures
 - Ordering & Receipt of Goods
 - Income Control
 - Cash Control
 - Payroll & Staffing
 - Budget Monitoring
 - Stock Control
 - Security
 - Statutory Issues
 - Follow up recommendations made in April 2005
- 1.9 This report sets out the findings of the review and makes recommendations, where it is felt that improvements in financial and non-financial administration should be made.

2. Objectives of the Audit

- 2.1. The main objectives of the audit were to ensure:
 - Business objectives are being met, including financial management
 - Ordering of goods and services is in line with regulations and VFM
 - Income is captured, recorded and banked
 - Cash is secure
 - Staff resources are adequately managed
 - Stocks and Stores are adequate and safeguarded:
 - Security of cash, customers, staff, building and IT systems is adequate
 - Relevant laws and regulations are complied with

3. Audit Opinion

- 3.1. Controls in place to meet the objectives stated in section two are adequate however, based on the lack of implementation of these controls in key areas such as business planning, budget monitoring, Criminal Records Bureau (CRB) checks and health and safety controls, the overall audit opinion on Maesteg Swimming Pool is that there is <u>inadequate</u> control over the key risks to the operation.
- 3.2. It is concerning to note that despite the previous audit opinion from 2004/05 deeming the operation of controls to be inadequate there has been little, if any, improvement in the compliance with key controls at the centre.
- 3.3. We have also made a small number of recommendations, which include one off occurrences of failures in control which may be due to one off errors or weaknesses in the system. These are detailed in the main report and accompanying action plan, categorised as Merits Attention.
- 3.4. This audit report is a report of exception and therefore only where issues have been identified have they been commented upon.

Acknowledgement

A number of staff gave us their time and co-operation during the course of this review. We would like to record our thanks to all of the individuals concerned

4. Findings and Recommendations

Risk may be viewed as the chance, or probability, of one or more of the organisation's objectives not being met. It refers both to unwanted outcomes which might arise, and to the potential failure to realise desired results.

The **recommendations** column is categorised on the following basis:

Fundamental	-	action that is considered imperative to ensure that the organisation is not exposed to high risks;
Significant Merits attention	-	action that is considered necessary to avoid exposure to significant risks; action that is considered desirable and should result in enhanced control or better value for money.

4.1 Budgetary Control

	Objective	Possible Risk	Test Result	Recommendation	Categorisation
4.1.1	monitored and action taken where necessary.	not taken and budgets are exceeded.	Finance prepare monthly budget spreadsheets which are saved on the computer network and accessible by the Pool Manager, Quality Development Manager and the Programme Development Manager A monthly business report is produced with the Pool manager collating the required information. Meetings are held monthly with the manager and Quality Development Manager / Programme Development Manager Summary review notes are then compiled with agreed action noted. However, during the management changes these meetings /reports have not always taken place/fully completed, with reports missing for July, August and September 2006 and February and March 2007.	by the Pool Manager to indicate that it has been subject to review and its contents are agreedb) Areas of concern should be investigated thoroughly as soon as possible by the Pool Manager and recorded appropriately.	

4.2 Cash Control

	Objective	Possible Risk	Test Result	Recommendation	Categorisation
4.2.1	To ensure cash allocated to the Pool is securely controlled.	There is a risk that cash is not issued to appropriate persons and not held securely.	undertaken and it was found to be complete.Random float checks are not carried out.	TMLS report on refunds/voids, this will allow a full review and reconciliation to printed receipts submitted to management. This could be carried out as a random exercise to identify inappropriate refunds and potential staff training.	Merits Attention

Maesteg Swimming Pool Internal Audit Report 23rd April 2008

	Objective	Possible Risk	Test Result	Recommendation	Categorisation
e	To ensure cash is lifted at the end of day and deposited		 A review of the banking process identified the following: Banking slip – 1/45 banking slip was not completed. Securicor do not sign daily collection forms however all receipts issued by Securicor are signed by Securicor staff. 1/44 daily cash collection forms was missing. 6/44 daily cash summary sections of the daily collection forms were not signed and counter signed 		Significant

4.3 Income

	Objective	Possible Risk	Test Result	Recommendation	Categorisation
4.3.1	To ensure cash received is administered and banked in tact.		 Hire charges are outstanding for two clubs, Bridgend Sharks and Maesteg Swimming Club. The estimated amount of outstanding payments was calculated as BS - £52.00, MSC - £2,164.50 Completed registers have not been input onto the computer system which generates the request for payment forms. Requests for payment have not been sent to BS for the period 13.03.07 to 27.03.07. Completed registers have not been input onto the computer system which generates the 	The hirer should be requested to authorize the block booking form prior to the use of facilities A copy of the completed registers for the hirer of facilities should be retained at the centre Completed registers must be entered onto the computer system in a timely manner to ensure that request for payment is generated and issued each month. Each hirer should make payment on their account monthly.	Significant

	Objective	Possible Risk	Test Result	Recommendation	Categorisation
4.3.2	To ensure vending income received is administered appropriately and banked intact.	There is a risk that vending machines are not emptied regularly, two persons are not present and where the vending is contracted to an external supplier, the Pool may not receive all commission due.	 through the till. Rates of vending commission were not evidenced at the Pool Checks have been made that the date emptied and the amount on the form reconciles with the till receipt. A reconciliation checking all till amounts have been banked was carried out. 	All evidence for vending and telephone income should be signed by both parties present. It is best practice to have a contract in place with all suppliers which should specify the rate of commission.	Merits Attention
4.3.3	To ensure Bridgecard issue is administered appropriately.	There is a risk that cards are issued to inappropriate persons.	• Bridge cards can be purchased from the Centre,	Bridgecard application forms should be completed in full by the appropriate staff member at the pool before submitting to the Bridge Card Office	Merits Attention

4.4 Ordering, Receipt and Payment of Goods and Services

Objective	Possible Risk	Test Result	Recommendation	Categorisation
4.4.1 To ensure that the ordering,	There is a risk that goods are ordered	 A review of 14 orders and 7 utility bills was completed and the following issues were identified when this process was reviewed: All orders have been ruled off and completed in full. 5/14 occasions there was no delivery note. On one occasion the delivery note was not signed or dated on receiving goods. A lack of segregation of duties between person ordering goods and authorising the invoice in 7/14 orders 3 suppliers were not on the approved supplier list published by Procurement. Such suppliers may not have adequate insurance cover as outlined in contract procedure rules and may not represent value for money. 1/14 invoice stamped on receipt 4/14 invoice amounts did not agree to order amount due to discount not being applied on the order form. A further 4/14 invoices did not agree to order amount due to slight discrepancies in price and some items not delivered. 	 a) There should be segregation of duties evident between ordering and receiving goods, and authorising payment. b) All delivery notes should be signed and dated by the person checking the goods. If there is no delivery note, it should be recorded on the order or invoice that the goods have been received, signed and dated by the recipient. c) Discounts should be applied to orders where applicable. d) Correct up to date prices should be used on orders. e) Meter readings should be checked on receipt of utility bills, to ensure the bill corresponds to the correct usage. f) The pool should consider maintaining a periodic payments register, to prevent overcharges by utility companies and to 	Categorisation

	roll and Staffing			
4.5.1 4.5.1	To ensure that Staff are only paid overtime that has been worked and documents support the claim. Job descriptions, CRB checks, and qualifications are in place for staff.	There is a risk that staff are paid for hours not worked. There is a risk that staff do not hold the requisite level of qualifications to undertake their role and job descriptions are outdated such that they do not accurately represent the duties carried out. Staff that have not been CRB checked could be working with minors.	 Long term sickness of the permanent Pool Manager over several years has resulted in several changes to the management of the pool and a temporary manager has recently been placed at the pool to c) All timesheets should be verified for accuracy. 	Significant

4.6 Procedures

	Objective	Possible Risk	Test Result	Recommendation	Categorisation
4.6.1	Ensure that business plans are in place and policy and procedures are adhered to.	The Pool is operating with no strategic planning or direction which may lead to a failure of the establishment to meet its objectives.	prepared, due to staff problems. The 2007/8 business plan is to be prepared shortly now the Leisure department plans have been finalised.	 a) An up to date Business Plan should be complete and available at the swimming pool b) Relevant policy and procedures should be made available to all staff. 	Significant

4.7 Statutory

Objective	Possible Risk	Test Result	Recommendation	Categorisation
		 A review of Health & Safety Risk Assessments (RA's) was carried out and the following noted: The temporary manager developed generic RA's as part of his previous duties which have been passed to Maesteg Swimming Pool, however are not in use. The designated Risk Assessment file contained assessments for pregnant workers and the Canoe Club. Further RA's filed incorrectly dated in 1999 and reviewed 2004. Health & Safety committee meets every quarter, minutes reviewed for June, September and December 2006 and March 2007. Representation of Maesteg Swimming Pool for 2/4 meetings, with the temporary manager Greg Allen attending on the two occasions. 		

4.8 Stock Control

	Objective	Possible Risk	Test Result	Recommendation	Categorisati on
4.8.1	Ensure stock is controlled appropriately, logged in and out and write offs are appropriately evidenced and documented.	There is a risk that stock is lost through poor record keeping and stock control procedures.	 Stockwatch. Income Vs stock comparison indicates a deficit of £74.71 for the two month period to the 28th March 2007, this represents just over 4% of actual receipts for that period. Target stock holding indicates that the pool is over target by £236.12. Discussion with management clarified that the pool does not follow any stock control procedures relating to reordering. 	 a) Stock control procedures should be followed, for example introducing minimum and maximum stock levels for reordering, reducing the stock record total each time an item is sold etc b) Use by dates should be reviewed when receiving goods to ensure that goods are not out of date and have a sufficient shelf life. c) The pool should implement a more thorough system for writing off stock, using the process where a form is completed and signed by two members of staff. d) Stock control should be introduced for sports equipment e.g. goggles and badges/goggles etc. e) The TMLS system should be reviewed to identify whether a stock control within the Swimming Pool 	

4.9 Security

	Objective	Possible Risk	Test Result	Recommendation	Categorisati on
4.9.1	To ensure security of assets is adequate		was not in use throughout the audit process giving	 be activated and only authorised staff given access to the security keypad number. Authorises staff should be limited to the Manager b) A log of keys issued to staff should be updated as soon as any changes occur. c) The possibility of a 'time out' system being introduced to TMLS should be considered and users should log out of the computer system when not in use. 	Significant Merits Attention Merits Attention Merits Attention

Objective	Possible Risk	Test Result	Recommendation	Categorisati
				on
	There is a risk that assets paid for are no longer held by the Pool and the Council is not aware of their existence.	electronically annually, the most recent being January 2007, however this was not checked or authorised.		

4.10 Follow up Recommendations

Objective	Possible Risk	Test Result	Recommendation	Categorisati
				on
Review 2005/06 recommendations and enquire to their completeness, where they are not being covered as part of main audit review.		8	All recommendations should be implemented in a timely manner.	Significant

Note: Unimplemented recommendations from the 2005/06 follow have been restated in this report and are denoted by an (*) in the Management Action Plan

5.1 Management Action Plan

Rec. No.	Recommendation	Para. No.	Categorisation	Agreed	Management Comments	Officer Responsible	Date to be implemented
1	 a) All budget reports should be signed off by the Pool Manager to indicate that it has been subject to review and its contents are agreed. b) Areas of concern should be investigated thoroughly as soon as possible by the Pool Manager and recorded appropriately. c) Monthly management meetings and Business Reports should be completed in a timely manner 	4.1.1	Significant	Yes	Monthly meetings started from Nov 2007 Review documents available Copies held at site and by Programme Development Manager	Pool Manager Programme Development Manager (Line Manager)	June 2008
2	 a) All Z-reading should be appropriately extracted, signed by two persons and the difference between the Z-reading and banking should be investigated. b) Daily Cash Collection forms should be signed by two persons prior to collection by Securicor and signed on collection by the Head Attendant. 	4.2.2	Significant	Yes	Training required for all relevant members of staff Roles and Responsibilities need to be clearly defined	Pool Manager Head Assistant	June 2008
3	 a) The hirer should be requested to authorize the block booking form prior to the use of facilities (*) b) A copy of the completed registers for the hirer of facilities should be retained at the centre c) Completed registers must be entered onto the computer system in a timely manner to ensure that request for payment is generated and issued each month. d) Each hirer should make payment on their account monthly. 	4.3.1	Significant	Yes	Training required for all relevant members of staff on Sport and Recreation financial procedures Procedures currently being looked at by Senior Management Team	Strategy and Performance Manager Pool Manager Strategy and Performance Manager	June 2008

Rec. No.	Recommendation	Para. No.	Categorisation	Agreed	Management Comments	Officer Responsible	Date to be implemented
4	 a) There should be segregation of duties evident between ordering and receiving goods, and authorising payment. (*) b) All delivery notes should be signed and dated by the person checking the goods. If there is no 	4.4.1	Significant	Yes	Training required for all relevant members of staff on Sport and Recreation financial procedures	Strategy and Performance Manager	June 2008
	delivery note, it should be recorded on the order or invoice that the goods have been received, signed and dated by the recipient. (*)			Yes	As above	Strategy and Performance Manager	June 2008
	c) Discounts should be applied to orders where applicable.d) Correct up to date prices should be used on				As above		
	 orders. e) Meter readings should be checked on receipt of utility bills, to ensure the bill corresponds to the correct usage. 			Yes	Meter readings now being sent to Energy Manager to monitor usage etc	Energy Manager/Fina nce	
	 f) The pool should consider maintaining a periodic payments register, to prevent overcharges by utility companies and to monitor any unusual expenditure. 				Meeting to be called to clarify communication processes	Strategy and Performance Manager	June 2008
	g) Suppliers should be selected from the supplier list			Yes	Up to date suppliers list to be		
	 h) An authorised signatory list should be in place and a copy kept at the pool 			Yes	forwarded to every building Link with Finance to obtain current list		
5	 a) All signing in/out forms should be completed in full. (*) b) All timesheets should be verified for accuracy. c) All overtime on timesheets should be reconsidely to the signing in/out shorts. 	4.5.1	Significant	Yes	Training required for all relevant members of staff on Sport and Recreation financial procedures	Strategy and Performance Manager	
	 reconcilable to the signing in/out sheets d) All staff in contact with minors should be CRB checked whether they are new starters or current employees of the Pool. (*) e) All staff qualification certificates should be held 				Current HR policy is not checking existing staff. Policy in place for new starter	HR	June 2008
	 on staff personnel file. (*) f) A central record should be maintained indicating training certificate renewal/expiry dates 			Yes	Agreed –Training records to be kept on site and updated	Pool Manager/Train ing Co- ordinator	

Maesteg Swimming Pool Internal Audit Report 23rd April 2008

Rec. No.	Recommendation	Para. No.	Categorisation	Agreed	Management Comments	Officer Responsible	Date to be implemented
6	a) An up to date Business Plan should be complete and available at the swimming poolb) Relevant policy and procedures should be made available to all staff.	4.6.1	Significant	Yes	To be implemented from 1 st April 2008	Strategy and Performance Manager	April 2008
7	a) An up to date H&S Procedural Review Plan should be present at the pool and the manager should consider keeping a central record to demonstrate that the planned action has been taken.	4.7.1	Significant	Yes	Need to review IPS system at MSP	Strategy and Performance Manager Pool	June 2008
	 b) All certificates for 1st aiders should be held on site and rotas should be compiled based on staff qualifications and job descriptions. c) The water testing forms and checklists should be 			Yes	Records need to be updated	Manager/Facil ity Coordinator	June 2008
	 completed in full in line with issued guidance. d) The inflatable checklists should be completed in full in line with issued guidance. e) A full and comprehensive range of Risk Assessments should be maintained at the pool, reviewed annually and accessible to staff. 				Need to review IPS system at MSP	Strategy and Performance Manager	
8	The keypad on the reception door should be activated and only authorised staff given access to the security keypad number. Authorises staff should be limited to the Manager	4.9.1	Significant	Yes	Manager to restrict access to area	Pool Manager	March 2008
9	 a) Float handover records should be completed in full. b) Consideration should be given to using the TMLS report on refunds/voids, this will allow a full review and reconciliation to printed receipts submitted to management. This could be carried out as a random exercise to identify inappropriate refunds and potential staff training. 	4.2.1	Merits Attention	Yes	Training required for all relevant members of staff on Sport and Recreation financial procedures	Strategy and Performance Manager	June 2008
10	a) All E-returns should be completed and submitted in a timely manner.	4.2.2	Merits Attention	Yes	Training required for all relevant members of staff on Sport and Recreation financial procedures	Strategy and Performance Manager	June 2008

11	b) All evidence for vending and telephone income should be signed by both parties presentc) It is best practice to have a contract in place with all suppliers, which should specify the rate of commission.	4.3.2	Merits Attention	Yes	Training required for all relevant members of staff on Sport and Recreation financial procedures	Strategy and Performance Manager	June 2008
12	Bridge card application forms should be completed in full by the appropriate staff member at the pool before submitting to the Bridge Card Office	4.3.3	Merits Attention	Yes	Training required for all relevant members of staff on Sport and Recreation financial procedures- Bridge Card operation	Strategy and Performance Manager	June 2008
13	 a) The HASWA certificate should be updated to reflect the current Pool Manager. b) The pool should be consistently represented at Quarterly H&S Committee meetings. 	4.7.1	Merits Attention	Yes	Certificate to be updated Manager /Head Assistant to attend	Pool Manager	March 2008
14	 a) Stock control procedures should be followed, for example introducing minimum and maximum stock levels for reordering, reducing the stock record total each time an item is sold etc b) Use by dates should be reviewed when receiving goods to ensure that goods are not out of date and have a sufficient shelf life. c) The pool should implement a more thorough system for writing off stock, using the process where a form is completed and signed by two members of staff. d) Stock control should be introduced for sports equipment e.g. goggles and badges/goggles etc. e) The TMLS system should be reviewed to identify whether a stock control module is able to assist in stock control within the Swimming Pool 	4.8.1	Merits Attention	Yes Yes	Training required for all relevant members of staff on Sport and Recreation financial procedures- Vending Training required for all relevant members of staff on Sport and Recreation financial procedures- Vending operation Training required for all relevant members of staff on Sport and Recreation financial procedures	Strategy and Performance Manager Strategy and Performance Manager	June 2008

15	a) A log of keys issued to staff should be updated as soon as any changes occur. (*)b) The possibility of a 'time out' system being	4.9.1	Merits Attention	Yes	Pool Manager to investigate procedure currently in operation at BRC	Pool Manager	
	introduced to TMLS should be considered and users should log out of the computer system when not in use.c) Consideration should be given to periodic lists				Currently co-ordinated by		June 2008
	of current staff being made available to the Facilities Co-ordinator by the Centre Manager, in order for reconciliation between staff active on the TMLS system and current-staffing lists can be completed. This would identify any leavers of the Centre to be inactivated on the TMLS system.			Yes	Technical Support Officer - Manager to link with him	Pool Manager/Tech nical Support Officer	
16	a) Consider updating list more frequently, i.e. at the time of additions/disposals			Yes	Manager to update on a more frequent basis	Pool Manager	April 2008
	b) Consider verification of the inventory by a second person, with a copy being signed and dated.			Yes	2 people to sign updated document off	Pool Manager	

Note

As related to in the Introduction Maesteg Swimming Pool has suffered with major staffing difficulties for approximately 3 years with the long-term absence of the Pool Manger The Audit has highlighted various issues surrounding the lack of leadership and ownership from the pool. With this in mind a re focus and training of the various Sport and Recreation Policies and Procedures needs to be implemented at the pool

The imminent appointment of a Quality and Performance coordinator will ensure that standards and procedures are adhered to.

This post will be the main driver in ensuring all standards are met within the Sport and Recreation Department and hopefully will be in place by May 2008 This post will report to the Strategy and Performance Manager - for the Department

As the Department is already 2 members of the Senior Management Team (50%) short this post is seen to be vital in the "quality processes " required

The Training of the staff will be undertaken - in part - at their weekly staff training meetings

This will be programmed and signed off accordingly.

The Department is waiting for the updated version of its various policies currently being reviewed by the Senior Management Team

This Updated version will be the basis of the training where required for all the department.

Internal Audit Bridgend County Borough Council Brackla House Brackla Street CF31 1BZ internalaudit@bridgend.gov.uk